CONTENTS

Executive summary ........................................................................................................... 1
1 MATC project objectives ............................................................................................... 8
2 Preface .......................................................................................................................... 9
3 The importance of St Paul’s ..........................................................................................10
4 Response to the EES .....................................................................................................16
  4.1 Support for the Metro project .....................................................................................16
  4.2 Process .......................................................................................................................16
  4.3 Management of construction activity .........................................................................17
  4.4 Damage to building fabric .........................................................................................20
  4.5 Access to St Paul’s during construction .....................................................................23
  4.6 Dust, vibration & noise .............................................................................................24
  4.7 Construction hoardings and acoustic sheds ...............................................................26
  4.8 Redesign of City Square ...........................................................................................27
  4.9 Cathedral Close & Swanston Street frontage ...............................................................30
  4.10 The view of the Cathedral’s south front .................................................................31
  4.11 Pedestrian routes, post-construction .......................................................................33
  4.12 Swanston Street west side .......................................................................................34
  4.13 Station structures including entrances .....................................................................35
  4.14 Vents, shafts and emergency exits ..........................................................................37
  4.15 Assurance of design quality .....................................................................................37
  4.16 Amendment GC45 (DDO) .......................................................................................38
  4.17 Sustainability ............................................................................................................39

Appendices
Appendix A St Paul's Cathedral Structural Review and Request for Information List, prepared by Robert Bird Group
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This submission is made by the Melbourne Anglican Trust Corporation (MATC) as owners of St Paul's Cathedral, Melbourne. The following is the summary of the MATC submission. We reserve the right to expand upon or modify any of the contents of the submission should further information become available.

Support for the Metro Project

The Metro rail project is acknowledged by the MATC as an important infrastructure project for Victoria.

The Metro Rail Project is acknowledged as an important infrastructure project for Victoria, one that, when opened, will serve to assist and support the Cathedral’s spiritual, civic and social mission.

The Metro Rail Project offers opportunities to improve the way the Cathedral interacts with the city, not only in terms of spiritual sustenance, but also as a major civic, community and architectural institution and resource.

MATC looks forward to working with MMRP to bring such opportunities to fruition.

Process

Clear, consistent and defined communication between the MATC, the MMRP construction team and other affected stakeholders should be established.

Establish clear, consistent and defined communication between the MATC, the MMRP construction team and other affected stakeholders.

Directly involve St Paul’s Cathedral in the decision making process for the design of the CBD South Station Precinct.

Specific outcomes sought:

1. Appoint a CBD South Precinct ‘Construction Impacts Project Manager’ to:
   - Communicate with stakeholders and affected landowners about short/medium/long term construction impacts;
   - Engage in dialogue with stakeholders to ensure construction activity responds to changing events;
   - Assist with planning for disruptions to minimise and mitigate the impacts of disruption; and
   - Provide a point of contact to raise concerns, notify of critical or emergency incidents, and resolve issues.

2. Establish a clear process for application, approval and delivery of repair and remediation works during and after construction.

3. Involve and require sign-off from the MATC on the Ground Movement Management Plan.

4. Establish a clear chain of communication for representatives of the Cathedral to contact at MMRA in the event of a ‘red button’ emergency.

5. Involve the MATC in the decision making process for the CBD South Station Precinct, with particular emphasis on design input regarding:
The protection of vistas and the Cathedral profile;
City Square redesign; and
Federation Square station entry design and location.

6. Collaborate on city centre activation initiatives during construction, for example:
Messages and images on hoardings; and
Temporary or pop-up events.

Management of construction activity

The management of construction activities needs to appropriately align with the life of the church.

There should be a Project Objective to maintain, as far as possible, the effective working of the city.

Construction activities should be sensitive to the operation of the ‘life of the church’ and be appropriately managed to allow for regular services.

MATC wishes to be consulted on the detailed timing and extent of construction and related activities that might adversely affect the amenity of the Cathedral, and its ability to host the normal range of activities, at their normal times.

Construction access routes that reduce impact on streets within the Hoddle Grid (e.g. via Alexandra Gardens) should be considered.

MATC requests to be kept informed about potential disruptions, and consulted in a timely manner about the impact of disruptions.

Specific outcomes sought:

7. Ensure construction activities respect the operation of ‘the life of the church’:
Regular liturgical activities (particularly Sunday);
Spiritually significant times (Christmas and Easter);
Unplanned community and/or commemorative events (e.g. State funerals and public memorials);
Office uses, relating to both the Diocese and tenants.

8. Provide ongoing notification of the span of hours of construction activity, level of predicted noise during these times and other disruptions, such as:
Early works;
Boring of the mined cavern structure;
Operation of cavern to remove tunnelled material;
Construction of station structures.

9. Establish a process/plan/compensation for mitigation actions required as a result of disruptive construction impacts.

10. Establish a process to amend the construction hours in response to changing circumstances and unpredicted events.
Damage to building fabric

The management of construction activities needs to avoid or compensate for any material damage to the fabric of the Cathedral and ancillary buildings.

MATC seeks an undertaking that any damage or increased maintenance arising from the construction of MMRP and/or its subsequent operation will be compensated in full.

MATC wishes to be consulted on the environmental standards to be adopted during the construction phase.

An assurance is sought that, if the preferred mined cavern construction for CBD South Station were to be varied, provision would be made for a further independent engineering assessment on the impacts to the Cathedral.

Specific outcomes sought:

11. Conduct an existing conditions survey prior to construction – to identify baseline (pre-construction) conditions and potential vulnerabilities.

12. Undertake a Level 3 Risk Assessment during the detailed design phase of the project, based on the known vulnerability of the Cathedral Structure.

13. Produce a ground movement management plan which outlines:
   – Agreed acceptable ground movement thresholds for the Cathedral;
   – Specific mitigation measures to ensure thresholds are not exceeded;
   – Techniques for limiting construction impacts and protecting the building, internal fittings and the organ;
   – Additional measures to be undertaken if thresholds are exceeded.

14. Identify the construction impact thresholds and the events or triggers that would act as grounds to halt construction works.

15. Monitor ground movement during construction to verify assumptions made during the design and development of the construction methodology.

16. Utilise ground movement monitoring as a management tool to analyse movement trends and to take action before the design limits are exceeded.

17. Ensure that the design and construction of the pedestrian tunnel under the south-western corner of the site does not undermine the Cathedral and that a mined cavern construction method is utilised. A cut and cover construction method would be completely unacceptable in this location.

18. Fund ongoing repair to the building fabric during construction:
   – Particularly, cracks, re-pointing of external stonework, doors, windows and internal tiles.
   – Potentially, more serious structural works such as footings.

Access to St Paul’s during construction

The Cathedral is dependent on passing pedestrian traffic and easy pedestrian and service vehicle access for its daily operation and viability.

Confirmation is sought that there will be direct, convenient pedestrian access to the Cathedral, including at 209 Flinders Lane, during the life of the project.

Confirmation is sought that arrangements will be in place during construction to enable continued, uninterrupted vehicle access to the Cathedral and its environs, equivalent to current level of service.
Assurance is sought that MMRP will provide adequate notice, consultation and redress, should it be necessary to vary or diminish any access arrangements, including for deliveries and waste removal.

Specific outcomes sought:

19. Provide adequate signage in relation to:
   - Diversion or other changed access arrangements, for pedestrians and vehicles; and
   - Information about Cathedral activities, including ‘business as usual’ signage.

20. Consultation regarding the Truck Movement Schedule, particularly with respect to:
   - Avoiding an increase in truck movements;
   - Ensuring safe and efficient pedestrian movements for Cathedral visitors;
   - Maintaining vehicular access to 209 Flinders Lane.

Dust, vibration & noise

*The Cathedral’s fabric and fittings are unusually susceptible to damage from dust and vibration, and noise is particularly intrusive in an environment dedicated to prayer and contemplation.*

Additional maintenance and cleaning will be required to protect the building, fittings and organ during construction.

Noise from construction will require management to maintain the operation of the Cathedral.

Assurances are sought that the fabric and fittings of the building, including the TC Lewis Pipe Organ, won’t be damaged as a result of construction vibration.

MATC is concerned about the long term effects of exposure to the combination of dust, vibration and noise on the fabric of the building, staff, congregations and visitors.

Specific outcomes sought:

21. Compensation for additional maintenance, repairs and cleaning of the Cathedral as a result of vibration and additional dust from construction activities.

22. Implementation of sophisticated programme of air quality monitoring to:
   - Determine baseline conditions; and
   - Evaluate construction impacts.

23. Investigate potential short/medium term design changes such as a new airlock at Cathedral entrance.

24. Ensure measures are taken to reduce the amount of dust generated, e.g.:
   - Acoustic shed;
   - Hard covers on trucks.
Construction hoardings & acoustic sheds

As the Cathedral precinct is likely to be fronted on three sides with hoardings for considerable periods, the location, type and finish of the hoardings is of direct interest.

MATC seeks involvement with MMRP in a process for resolving the location, type and finish of construction hoardings and acoustic sheds.

MATC would value the opportunity to contribute suggestions as to the use of public art, imagery and messaging on hoardings in and around the Cathedral precinct.

Redesign of City Square

The proposed redesign of City Square, which provides the northern setting for the Cathedral and is an adjoining land use, is of vital interest to St Paul’s.

MATC has a vital interest in the design and use of a redeveloped City Square, and seeks close-in involvement in the resolution of the plans.

Views to the Cathedral from City Square should be maintained.

The north south axial view towards the Cathedral as accentuated by the existing water feature should be maintained.

Specific outcome sought:

25. Ensure the redesign of City Square maintains the north south axial view towards the Cathedral.

Cathedral Close & Swanston Street Frontage

There is an opportunity to improve the ways in which the Cathedral precinct interfaces with the city.

City of Melbourne is in discussion with MATC about possible conversion of part of the Cathedral Close parking area to public open space, and seeks MMRP involvement.

Construction of MMRP also provides an opportunity to review the design of the Cathedral’s interface with Swanston Street and Flinders Street, and to review the total setting for the Cathedral.

The view of the Cathedral’s South Front

Changes to the design of Federation Square need to acknowledge that the Cathedral’s south front is an important part of Melbourne’s identity.

MATC is vitally interested in the design outcomes on Federation Square, arising from MMRP structures and the redesign of the western ‘shard’, and wishes to be involved in key design and siting decisions.

The view from St Paul’s Court within Federation Square should not alter from the current view when viewed on the north-south axis.

The view from Princes Bridge remains equally important.
Specific outcome sought:

26. The view from St Paul’s Court within Federation Square should not alter from the current view when viewed on the north-south axis.

Pedestrian routes, post-construction

The works associated with the MMRP provide an opportunity to consider permanent improvements to pedestrian circulation through and around the Cathedral Precinct.

MATC offers to work with MMRP to review pedestrian circulation through and around the Cathedral Precinct.

Opportunities may exist to improve pedestrian circulation:

- To the east of the Cathedral, linking the south east corner of City Square to Flinders Street.
- At the crossing of Flinders Street, possibly by extending (not moving) the Flinders Street/Swanston Street pedestrian crossing east along Flinders Street, opposite the south front of the Cathedral; urban design and paving improvements associated with this could provide an enhanced visual setting for the Cathedral.

Swanston Street west side

The west side of Swanston Street, opposite the Cathedral, includes a cluster of important heritage buildings and a key MMRP development site.

An essential design parameter for the redevelopment of the properties on the west side of Swanston Street should be the view to and from and against St Paul’s.

The forty metre height limit on the west side of Swanston Street should not be varied under discretion for commercial advantage.

The opportunity should be grasped to further upgrade the quality of ground floor uses opposite the Cathedral, and to improve the public realm of this block of Swanston Street.

Specific outcome sought:

27. Avoid the removal of mature plane trees from Swanston Street during construction.

Station structures including entrances

The design of station structures on Collins Street, Flinders Street and Swanston Street needs clarification.

The visual impact of CBD South Station structures should be minimised and be designed to maintain the prominence of heritage buildings.

Melbourne Metro Urban Design Strategy should provide detailed guidelines on how surface structures will be assessed to meet standards of high quality design and finish.

The view of St Paul’s Cathedral from St Paul’s Court should not alter from the current view when viewed on the north-south axis.
Vents, shafts and emergency exits

*The design, configuration and location of vents, shafts and emergency exits need clarification.*

Vents, shafts, emergency exits and other auxiliary features of the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel should be sited sensitively to ensure they don’t detract from the appearance of the Cathedral.

MATC would value the opportunity to provide input into the location and configuration of vents, shafts and emergency exits associated with the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel.

Assurance of design quality

*Design quality needs to be assured by means of appropriate process.*

Further detail is sought as to how visual impacts would be managed through compliance with the Melbourne Metro Urban Design Strategy, and what if any interaction with this process would be afforded to St Paul’s.

Amendment Gc45 (DDO)

*The proposed Planning Scheme Amendment should encompass the minimum necessary land area and timeframe.*

Specific outcomes sought:

28. Reduce the area covered by Amendment GC45 to the land explicitly subject to air rights purchase by the MMRP.

29. Include in Amendment GC45 a sunset clause removing the overlay that includes St Paul’s at the conclusion of the construction works.

Sustainability

*The MMRP project provides an opportunity to demonstrate best sustainable practice in construction and design.*

The MMRP project should demonstrate best sustainable practice in construction and design.
1 MATC PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The MATC / St Paul’s Cathedral recognise the long term benefits of the Melbourne Metro Project and acknowledge that many of the objectives of Melbourne Metro Rail Project align with the Core Mission Objectives of St Paul’s Cathedral.

Notwithstanding the Cathedral’s support for the project, the Cathedral remain concerned with regard to the detail and the assessment of impacts of both the construction and operation of the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel including the final design.

Underpinning the submission of St Paul’s Cathedrals to Draft MMRP EES are the following objectives:

To preserve the nationally accredited heritage built form assets of St Paul’s Cathedral, including its interior fittings and pipe organ.

To protect the Cathedral setting as a highly important element of the southern gateway to the Melbourne Civic Spine and views to the Cathedral and its spires.

To protect access to the Cathedral for the duration of the construction of Melbourne Metro’s CBD South Station and to minimise the detrimental effects of traffic disruption, noise and air quality particularly during worship.

To work with the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority, construction firms and rail operators in a constructive and collaborative manner to achieve our common aims.

Figure 1 St Paul’s congregation (Source: Matt Irwin Photographer)
2 PREFACE

This is a submission in response to the Melbourne Metro Rail Project (MMRP) Environmental Effects Statement (EES).

In 2026, a station on the Sunbury to Cranbourne and Pakenham Metro line will open in CBD South, accessed from various points in the vicinity of St Paul’s Cathedral. The line will run from Footscray, tunnel beneath North Melbourne to new stations at Parkville, the CBD, and at Domain, and rejoin the surface rail system near South Yarra station. Prior to 2026, the line and stations will be under construction, including extensive tunnelling beneath and around Swanston Street and the Cathedral precinct.

This submission considers relevant content of the following EES documents:

- Summary Document
- Chapter 1, 2, 9, 10, 16 and 24
- Technical Appendices A, E (2 parts), L, M

The Melbourne Anglican Trust Corporation (MATC) representing, St Paul’s Cathedral, is supportive of the Melbourne Metro project and the ongoing social and economic benefits to the City of Melbourne.

St Paul’s has benefitted from specific briefings by members of the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority (MMRA):

- Briefing to Chapter (February 2016)
- Briefing to Precinct Committee (March 2016)
- Briefing to Archbishop in Council, Trustees and members of Chapter (April 2016).
THE IMPORTANCE OF ST PAUL’S

St Paul’s Cathedral is Melbourne’s Anglican Cathedral and the seat of the Archbishop of Melbourne. It is currently celebrating the 125th Anniversary of its consecration.

St Paul’s Cathedral is one of the most visited places in Melbourne, attracting some 400,000 tourists and pilgrims annually. It is a vital, living site in the centre of the City providing worship, pastoral care, and inspiration for residents and visitors.

The building is socially and historically important as a landmark on one of Australia’s busiest intersections. It makes an important contribution to the Civic Spine of Melbourne that extends down Swanston Street and continues to the Shrine of Remembrance along St Kilda Road. The Cathedral sits at the southern gateway to Melbourne on one of its most iconic intersections along with Flinders Street Station, Young and Jacksons and Federation Square.

St Paul’s Cathedral is home to worshippers from more than 25 nations. The Cathedral is open for worship and visiting every day of the year, and each year leads more than 1,000 acts of worship attended by more than 80,000 worshippers. Among its many visitors are countless pilgrims, making the Cathedral one of the most visited religious sites in the nation.

The site has been used as a church since the establishment of Melbourne. St Paul’s Cathedral was built in stages with the current building replacing a previous parish church bearing the same dedication. The current building was designed by English gothic revival architect William Butterfield. It is unique among Anglican Cathedrals in its north-south orientation. While the Cathedral was consecrated in 1891, construction of the spires did not commence until 1926, to the design of John Barr of Sydney, superseding Butterfield's original design.

Figure 2 St Paul's Cathedral as viewed from Flinders Street Station
Our Cathedral vision

The vision of St Paul's Cathedral is to be a place of transformation for this City and Diocese where all people can come to experience and know God's love in Christ Jesus.

This Vision flows from the Cathedral's position at the heart of our City and Diocese: Its witness as an iconic symbol of faith for the people of Melbourne, and its function as the home church of the Diocese of Melbourne, and the Anglican Province of Victoria.

The Cathedral's ten mission commitments

The Cathedral fulfils its vision by its commitment to being and becoming a place of:

- Prayer that speaks of the presence of God in the heart of the state capital
- Welcome that actively reaches out to the peoples of this City
- Evangelisation that makes and equips new generations of Christians
- Belonging that is a home for the people of the Diocese and City of Melbourne
- Advocacy that promotes initiatives to fight poverty and injustice in this City
- Education that encourages public conversations about Christ
- Innovation that effectively communicates the Good News using the opportunities offered by new media
- Excellence that stimulates growth in the Diocese of Melbourne
- Imagination and Beauty that works closely with the creative arts in this City
- Sustainable Living that increases renewable energies and models practices that safeguard God's good creation

Heritage significance

The Building has high significance though:

Its Heritage Listings –

St. Paul's Cathedral, Diocesan Offices and Chapter House are of aesthetic, architectural, cultural, historical, social and spiritual significance to the State of Victoria.

St Paul’s Cathedral is aesthetically and architecturally significant as an assured example of the work of English architect, William Butterfield, exhibiting many of the trademark qualities of his work, including the use of simple, robust forms, and constructional polychromy, achieved in this instance through the use of banded contrasting stonework. It is the only example of the use of polytexture (i.e. contrasts in the texture of stone facing) in Victoria.

St Paul’s Cathedral, the Chapter House and Diocesan Offices are protected in the heritage overlay of the City of Melbourne planning scheme (HO655). The whole of the cathedral site is protected, including the car park to the east side of the Cathedral.

The Cathedral is included on the Victorian Heritage Register (H18). The extent of the registration includes the Cathedral, the Diocesan and Cathedral Offices, Chapter House and associated land including the small curtilage on the Flinders Lane, Flinders Street and Swanston Street frontages and the car park to the south of the Diocesan and Cathedral Offices.

St Paul's Cathedral Precinct is of architectural, historic, scientific (technical) importance to the State of Victoria.
The Cathedral, Chapter House and Diocesan offices are also listed on the Register of the National Estate.

St Paul’s Cathedral and its organ are classified by the National Trust.

Elements of the Cathedral deemed to be historically significant include:

- The Cathedral Building,
- The Diocesan Offices and Chapter House,
- The Cathedral Interior including many of the fittings such as the Pulpit and Lectern, the reredos, the Tiles and Mosaics, the Stained Glass Windows and
- The Lewis organ,

and are all considered of Primary Significance.
Its *Architects and Architecture* –

William Butterfield the eminent English ecclesiastical architect was chosen to design Melbourne’s new Anglican Cathedral. St Paul’s Cathedral is one of only two Butterfield church designs in Australia. The other is St Peter’s Cathedral Adelaide.

Butterfield was not a conventional Gothic Revivalist. His buildings placed an emphasis on powerful forms, simple, flat wall planes enlivened with colour, built into the fabric of his buildings through the use of constructional polychromy. Many of his churches were polychrome brick, but at St Paul’s Cathedral, the polychromatic effect was achieved through the use of a variety of stones.

Butterfield designed the cathedral in the architectural style of Gothic transitional. The foundation stone was laid in 1880 and, on 22 January 1891 the cathedral was consecrated by the Rt Revd Charles Perry, Bishop of Melbourne, in the presence of John, Earl of Hopetoun (later Marquess of Linlithgow), Governor of Victoria.

Terry and Oakden renowned ecclesiastical architects supervised the work locally.

Influential Victorian era architect in Melbourne, Joseph Reed, completed the building of the Cathedral Offices and Chapter House to the designs of Butterfield when the architect resigned the project in 1887. Reed was faithful to the original design, but provided most of the furnishings, including the elaborate pulpit. Reed established a practice, Reed and Barnes in 1862, which is now known as Bates Smart.

John Barr, Sydney based Architect designed the Spires erected in 1926.

The Cathedral bells are housed in the southeast tower. The bells, thirteen in number, were the heaviest peal cast in the reign of Queen Victoria by the Mears and Stainbank foundry at Whitechapel, London. The bells are rung regularly on Sundays and Wednesdays and on civic occasions.

The 1960s saw extensive work completed to the exterior of the cathedral and the T.C. Lewis organ was restored in 1989 by a major National Trust appeal. Major restoration works were completed in 2009 with significant repairs to the spires, the building of the Moorhouse Tower Lantern and the new processional doors.

Concerns about damage to the Spires from traffic vibration led to a restoration project in 2009. Infrequent monitoring of the towers is part of the cyclical maintenance regime for the buildings.

A feature of the interior of the building is the imported earthenware mosaic tiles on floor and glazed ceramic tiles on the walls, all to Butterfield’s design. The reredos and the area around the high altar features imported marble, alabaster and Venetian glass mosaics. The ceiling is West Australian Kauri.

**Current activities**

St Paul’s Cathedral is a place of significant and frequent cultural, non-denominational and liturgical events many with Melbourne or State-wide importance. The Cathedral’s principal worship activities take place on Saturdays and Sundays, when six or more separate congregations meet on Saturday mornings and throughout the day on Sundays (see below for the typical weekly schedule). On most Saturdays the Cathedral will hold a number of weddings, and on most Sundays a number of baptisms, all of which take place outside the regular service schedule. Sunday afternoons frequently see significant diocesan services.
In addition, the Cathedral regularly acts as a large-scale venue for state-sponsored or community commemorative services, such as State Funerals, Memorial, Commemorative and Anniversary Services, often held on Sundays or during the course of the week. This has included memorial services for Black Saturday, for the victims of the MH70 airline crash and most recently for the victims of the shooting in Orlando, Florida for the LGBTI Community.

There are regular lunchtime music recitals and artistic and historical displays in the Cathedral’s Transept Gallery and is renowned for the quality of the choral singing by the St Paul’s choir and its organ.

The Cathedral also hosts significant services and ceremonies for the many Anglican Schools of Melbourne, which also draw large number of students and parents.

Over 6,000 people attend the Cathedral at Christmas, including Christmas Eve and Christmas Day services, and Easter is also a time of particularly large congregation numbers.

**Weekly schedule**

The following is an example of regular services held at the Cathedral, which is supplemented by many more at other times.

- **Regular Sunday Worship**
  - 8am Eucharist
  - 9am Eucharist
  - 10.30am Eucharist
  - 6pm Evensong
- **Regular Monday to Friday Worship**
  - 12.15pm Eucharist
  - 5.10pm Evensong
- **Regular Saturday Worship**
  - 10am Mandarin Worship
  - 12.15pm Eucharist
- **Regular Lunchtime Concerts**
  - 1:00pm Wednesdays
  - English Conversation Classes (Monday)
  - 2pm Open and registration
  - 2:30-4pm English Conversation Class
  - 4:0-4:30pm Bible Story in English
  - 5.10pm Simple English Worship Service (Optional)

**The Cathedral & civic identity**

The Cathedral makes an important contribution to the Civic Spine of Melbourne that extends down Swanston Street and continues to the Shrine along St Kilda Road. The Cathedral sits at the southern gateway to Melbourne.
St Paul’s Cathedral is built on one of the most prominent sites in Melbourne’s Hoddle Grid, and makes a vital contribution to the identity of Melbourne. It is:

On the corner of the principal entry point to the city centre from the south, on the edge of the Hoddle Grid.

The gateway to Swanston Street, which is both Melbourne’s civic spine and, as one of the world’s busiest public transport thoroughfares, the city’s ‘entrance hallway’.

One of a collection of important civic and cultural landmarks that line the civic spine along Swanston Street and St Kilda Road, a culturally significant axis that aligns on the focal point of The Shrine.

One of a group of Melbourne icons and landmarks at one of the busiest and most recognisable intersections in the city, along with the domed entrance to Flinders Street Station, the historic Young & Jackson’s hotel, and Federation Square.

Figure 4 St Paul’s Cathedral congregation celebrating the attendance of the Archbishop of Canterbury
4 RESPONSE TO THE EES

4.1 SUPPORT FOR THE METRO PROJECT

The Metro rail project is acknowledged by the MATC as an important infrastructure project for Victoria.

The Metro Rail Project is acknowledged as an important infrastructure project for Victoria, one that, when opened, will serve to assist and support the Cathedral’s spiritual, civic and social mission.

The Metro Rail Project offers opportunities to improve the way the Cathedral interacts with the city, not only in terms of spiritual sustenance, but also as a major civic, community and architectural institution and resource.

MATC looks forward to working with MMRP to bring such opportunities to fruition.

The Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel is a transformative city-shaping project that will influence the development of Metropolitan Melbourne for a generation. The project will increase capacity on the rail network catering for more reliable and more frequent provision of train services across metropolitan Melbourne.

As Melbourne becomes a city of 6 million people by 2031 and a city of nearly 8 million by 2051, Melbourne Metro will be essential in catering for a sustainable, efficient and socially cohesive city. The Metro Rail Tunnel will improve access to employment opportunities, recreational activities, educational opportunities, and civic participation.

4.2 PROCESS

Clear, consistent and defined communication between the MATC, the MMRP construction team and affected stakeholders should be established.

Establish clear, consistent and defined communication between the MATC, the MMRP construction team and other affected stakeholders.

Directly involve St Paul’s Cathedral in the decision making process for the design of the CBD South Station Precinct.

The Cathedral notes the lack of time given to adequately respond to the volume of material contained in the EES. It is not considered that this timeframe was fair and reasonable, and verges on a denial of natural justice. Additionally, the absence of information and concept designs on key components of the project such as station entrances is noted. These deficiencies in the EES process highlight the need for ongoing dialog between the Cathedral, the MMRA and MMRP construction team to ensure sufficient opportunity to provide comment and input on key decisions, particularly in relation to station design.

As the construction for the MMRP will span a number of years, the need for ongoing communication between affected property owners, the MMRA and MMRP construction team will be essential to maintain a collaborative relationship. The Cathedral is particularly interested in the obligations of contractors to engage with affected parties. The Cathedral seeks a relationship where contractors not only inform stakeholders of disruption of construction but work with stakeholders to minimise the
impacts of construction on their operations in a mutually respectful way to the benefit of Melburnians.

Specific outcomes sought:

1. Appoint a CBD South Precinct ‘Construction Impacts Project Manager’ to:
   - Communicate with stakeholders and affected landowners about short/medium/long term construction impacts;
   - Engage in dialogue with stakeholders to ensure construction activity responds to changing events;
   - Assist with planning for disruptions to minimise and mitigate the impacts of disruption; and
   - Provide a point of contact to raise concerns, notify of critical or emergency incidents, and resolve issues.

2. Establish a clear process for application, approval and delivery of repair and remediation works during and after construction.

3. Involve and require sign-off from the MATC on the Ground Movement Management Plan.

4. Establish a clear chain of communication for representatives of the Cathedral to contact at MMRA in the event of a ‘red button’ emergency.

5. Involve the MATC in the decision making process for the CBD South Station Precinct, with particular emphasis on design input regarding:
   - The protection of vistas and the Cathedral profile;
   - City Square redesign; and
   - Federation Square station entry design and location.

6. Collaborate on city centre activation initiatives during construction, for example:
   - Messages and images on hoardings; and
   - Temporary or pop-up events.

4.3 MANAGEMENT OF CONSTRUCTION ACTIVITY

The management of construction activities needs to appropriately align with the life of the church.

There should be a Project Objective to maintain, as far as possible, the effective working of the city.

Construction activities should be sensitive to the operation of the ‘life of the church’ and be appropriately managed to allow for regular services.

MATC wishes to be consulted on the detailed timing and extent of construction and related activities that might adversely affect the amenity of the Cathedral, and its ability to host the normal range of activities, at their normal times.

Construction access routes that reduce impact on streets within the Hoddle Grid (e.g. via Alexandra Gardens) should be considered.

MATC requests to be kept informed about potential disruptions, and consulted in a timely manner about the impact of disruptions.

The construction phase of the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel represents a major change in the environment surrounding the Cathedral from low impact commercial
and retail activities to high-intensity and high-impact construction and mining activities. This change will have a significant impact on the anticipated level of amenity experienced at the Cathedral. It is not clear how the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority plans to mitigate and minimise the negative impacts of construction on the operations of the Cathedral. The management of construction activities in line with the orderly operation of the city particularly within the CBD South Station precinct is not outlined by the EES.

The Project Objectives do not include commentary on minimizing the detrimental effects of construction on the operation of the City, its businesses and institutions. While we support the overall vision for the project, there should be an objective to maintain as far as possible the effective working of the city and its component parts. It is noted that some words to this effect are included under 1.3.3 Evaluation Criteria.

St Paul’s Cathedral operates across a broad span of hours each day of the week hosting a variety of cultural and liturgical events ranging from worship services, weddings, baptisms and music recitals. Additionally the Cathedral is open and accessible to the public as a quiet and peaceful space for contemplation and reflection through the day between scheduled events.

The principal worship activities of the Cathedral take place on Saturdays and Sundays with a busy schedule of regular worship services. Six separate congregations meet at St Paul’s Cathedral over a weekend period. In addition to this, a busy programme of weddings and baptisms take place between regular services over a weekend.

The Cathedral also acts as a large-scale venue for state-sponsored or community commemorative services, such as State Funerals, Memorials, Commemorative and Anniversary Services. These events can be held at a variety of times during the week the course of the week and are not necessarily held on Sundays. These kinds of events are generally unforeseen or unplanned with short lead-in times to the events being held.

Owing to the Cathedral’s accessible location and relationship to civic spaces such as the City Square and Federation Square, St Paul’s is well placed to act as a venue for community and state-sponsored events. It is important to note that these events can include non-denominational and ecumenical services and aim to be an inclusive and welcoming environment.

It is noted that the draft ESS includes provision to cease and or silence works during times of special significance that would impact on the Shrine of Remembrance. Similar provisions to cease and or silence works that would impact on the Cathedral during times of significance should be extended to St Paul’s Cathedral. Times of significance for the Cathedral would include Holy Week (particularly Good Friday and Easter Sunday), Christmas Eve, Christmas Day and State remembrance, memorial and funeral services.

It is anticipated that potentially disruptive construction activity such as road closures, earthworks and piling that may limit access, produce noise or cause discomfort will be scheduled to take place at times of the day and week when it is least disruptive to city residents and businesses (between 9:00am and 5:00pm on Monday to Friday). This submission notes, however, that the liveliest times in the life of the Cathedral are counter to the liveliest times in the life of the city, with times outside weekday business hours involving the highest visitation in the schedule of the Cathedral.
Unmanaged and disruptive construction activities during these times (particularly Saturdays and Sundays) would represent a major threat to the practical functioning of the Cathedral. A quiet, peaceful and solemn environment within the Cathedral is a prerequisite to the appropriate use of the space. A particular concern is the combined effects of disruption, vibration, noise and dust due to sustained construction activity over the long construction timeline of the project. These combined effects may have a significant impact on the lived experience of Cathedral users. The rationale for selection of the City Square as the launching site for construction activities must be detailed. Alternate sites such as Alexandra Gardens may allow for less impact on City Square and fewer truck movements within the Hoddle Grid. The potential of using an alternative site for construction activity should be considered in order to minimise long term disruption within the CBD over a number of years. Alternative construction methodologies that create less impact on the CBD at within the CBD South Station precinct should seriously be considered.

Specific outcomes sought:

7. Ensure construction activities respect the operation of ‘the life of the church’:
   - Regular liturgical activities (particularly Sunday);
   - Spiritually significant times (Christmas and Easter);
   - Unplanned community and/or commemorative events (e.g. State funerals and public memorials);
   - Office uses, relating to both the Diocese and tenants.

8. Provide ongoing notification of the span of hours of construction activity, level of predicted noise during these times and other disruptions, such as:
   - Early works;
   - Boring of the mined cavern structure;
   - Operation of cavern to remove tunnelled material;
   - Construction of station structures.
9. Establish a process/plan/compensation for mitigation actions required as a result of disruptive construction impacts.

10. Establish a process to amend the construction hours in response to changing circumstances and unpredicted events.

4.4 DAMAGE TO BUILDING FABRIC

The management of construction activities needs to avoid or compensate for any material damage to the fabric of the Cathedral and ancillary buildings.

MATC seeks an undertaking that any damage or increased maintenance arising from the construction of MMRP and/or its subsequent operation will be compensated in full.

MATC wishes to be consulted on the environmental standards to be adopted during the construction phase.

An assurance is sought that, if the preferred mined cavern construction for CBD South Station were to be varied, provision would be made for a further independent engineering assessment on the impacts to the Cathedral.

As a stone building constructed in 1892 St Paul’s Cathedral is particularly susceptible to damage to its building fabric as a result of changes in ground conditions. Aspects of the building at particular risk of damage include the stonework, sandstone detailing, stained glass window and internal floor and wall tiles. It is understood that the Cathedral is founded over a siltstone and sandstone base. It is also important to note that a series of underground brick tunnels run beneath the floor of the Cathedral in a north-south alignment. See Plan below.
Due to its construction materials and techniques the Cathedral is not a flexible building. The overall structural integrity and stability of the building is at significant risk from ground movement and vibration as a result of tunnel construction. Advice from Robert Bird Group notes that the Cathedral is very sensitive to ground movement, vibration and any change to existing founding condition. A structural review and full RFI list prepared by Robert Bird Group is attached at Appendix A. It is evidenced from examples such as Christchurch, that even though churches appear to be the most solid and stable buildings in a city, they are potentially the most vulnerable to ground movement.

The EES notes that “ground movement is an expected outcome of any tunnelling project” and sets an objective to avoid or minimise adverse effects on land stability that might arise directly or indirectly from project works. The ESS also notes that this will be achieved practically through implementation of engineering solutions that would minimise ground movements; however the Cathedral is of the view that further site specific work is required. Although the Cathedral is satisfied with the building protection objectives of the draft EES report, a much greater definition of protection works with respect to the Cathedral building is required especially as the draft EES appears to be generic in nature with respect to the Cathedral.

While the EES suggests that the Cathedral is subject to negligible to minor impacts in respect to ground movements, it is unclear as to what detailed geotechnical or engineering advice this assessment is based upon. The foundations of the Cathedral are not fully known even to the Cathedral, and include bluestone, brick and brick tunnels. Under this assessment the likelihood of the shifting of tiles, cracking of plaster and movement of stonework is anticipated, causing superficial damages that could generally be resolved by repointing and replastering.

In addition it is noted that during excavation substances contained within the excavated soil and resulting dust may interact with the mortar and pointing of the Cathedral’s external stonework, causing deterioration or the need for increased cleaning. Ongoing monitoring of this risk will be required. The concept design assumes that construction techniques at this location could include cavern mining to establish a launching site for tunnelling under Swanston Street. In addition to this it is
assumed a pedestrian underpass will be tunnelled under the south-western corner of the Cathedral site. The mined cavern construction must be confirmed as divergence from the mined cavern construction technique for CBD South Station would represent a significant shift in technique and potential construction impacts. If a different construction technique was to be used it is expected that a revised engineering assessment on the impacts of construction on the damage to building fabric would be required.

A detailed site inspection including a Dilapidation Survey should be conducted prior to commencement of any works including preliminary works. There should be regular ongoing monitoring of the building including the spires for the duration of the project work at the CBD South Station. Additionally, appropriate environmental standards for construction impacts on buildings needs to be established, that set out minimum standards and guidelines for ongoing monitoring which will ensure buildings are protected.

A consideration of the long term effects of train movements in the Melbourne Metro Rail tunnel on the long term structural integrity of the Cathedral should also be provided.

Specific outcomes sought:

11. Conduct an existing conditions survey prior to construction – to identify baseline (pre-construction) conditions and potential vulnerabilities.
12. Undertake a Level 3 Risk Assessment during the detailed design phase of the project, based on the known vulnerability of the Cathedral Structure.
13. Produce a ground movement management plan which outlines:
   - Agreed acceptable ground movement thresholds for the Cathedral;
   - Specific mitigation measures to ensure thresholds are not exceeded;
   - Techniques for limiting construction impacts and protecting the building, internal fittings and the organ;
   - Additional measures to be undertaken if thresholds are exceeded.
14. Identify the construction impact thresholds and the events or triggers that would act as grounds to halt construction works.
15. Monitor ground movement during construction to verify assumptions made during the design and development of the construction methodology.
16. Utilise ground movement monitoring as a management tool to analyse movement trends and to take action before the design limits are exceeded.
17. Ensure that the design and construction of the pedestrian tunnel under the south-western corner of the site does not undermine the Cathedral and that a mined cavern construction method is utilised. A cut and cover construction method would be completely unacceptable in this location.
18. Fund ongoing repair to the building fabric during construction:
   - Particularly, cracks, re-pointing of external stonework, doors, windows and internal tiles.
   - Potentially, more serious structural works such as footings.
ACCESS TO ST PAUL’S DURING CONSTRUCTION

The Cathedral is dependent on passing pedestrian traffic and easy pedestrian and service vehicle access for its daily operation and viability.

Confirmation is sought that there will be direct, convenient pedestrian access to the Cathedral, including at 209 Flinders Lane, during the life of the project.

Confirmation is sought that arrangements will be in place during construction to enable continued, uninterrupted vehicle access to the Cathedral and its environs, equivalent to current level of service.

Assurance is sought that MMRP will provide adequate notice, consultation and redress, should it be necessary to vary or diminish any access arrangements, including for deliveries and waste removal.

Owing to its location on the corner of one of Melbourne’s most busy pedestrian intersections the surrounds of the Cathedral are characterised by heavy pedestrian footfall at most times of day. The Cathedral appreciates its proximity and accessibility to people and values the way this enables passing visitors, congregations, deliveries and staff to easily access the Cathedral. Additionally, there is concern that changes in traffic conditions may reduce the volume of passing visitors and have a corresponding impact on monetary donations to the Cathedral.

It is understood that Flinders Street, Swanston Street and Flinders Lane will be key access routes to the City Square and Flinders Street construction zones. The additional vehicular movements, and potential road and footpath closures, could represent a significant loss of pedestrian accessibility to the Cathedral over the duration of construction. Of equal importance to the Cathedral is access to the Cathedral and adjoining administrative buildings at 209 Flinders Lane.

While the EES has indicated that the assumed construction method for the CBD South Station will be the mined cavern technique, this must be confirmed. A mined cavern construction method would minimise disruption to surface activities, particularly vehicular, pedestrian and public transport movements. If a cut and cover construction method is to be employed for any aspect of construction within the CBD South Station precinct the MTAC reserves the right to review its submission.

The Cathedral particularly seeks an assurance that a cut and cover method will not be used to construct the underground pedestrian link between the CBD South Station and the Federation Square station entrance. This would constrain access to the Cathedral from Flinders Street and Swanston Street allowing for only limited access from Flinders Lane and Flinders Street via Chapter House Lane.

Given the Cathedral’s close proximity to three fronts of construction activity it is believed that special measures should be implemented to support land uses within the vicinity of the Cathedral during the construction phase of the project. These measures include providing signage indicating they remain open, maintaining access for customers, deliveries and waste removal, and keeping the Cathedral informed about planned construction activities.
Previous briefings to St Paul’s have indicated that there will be no disruption to pedestrian movements to and from St Paul’s Cathedral for the duration of the project. Confirmation of the anticipated traffic management arrangements is required including a description of the nature and length of potential road closures and the anticipated level of disruption in each stage of construction. Further to this consideration of ways to minimise this disruption should also be undertaken.

Specific outcomes sought:

19. Provide adequate signage in relation to:
   - Diversion or other changed access arrangements, for pedestrians and vehicles; and
   - Information about Cathedral activities, including ‘business as usual’ signage.

20. Consultation regarding the Truck Movement Schedule, particularly with respect to:
   - Avoiding an increase in truck movements;
   - Ensuring safe and efficient pedestrian movements for Cathedral visitors;
   - Maintaining vehicular access to 209 Flinders Lane.

4.6 DUST, VIBRATION & NOISE

The Cathedral’s fabric and fittings are unusually susceptible to damage from dust and vibration, and noise is particularly intrusive in an environment dedicated to prayer and contemplation.

Additional maintenance and cleaning will be required to protect the building, fittings and organ during construction.

Noise from construction will require management to maintain the operation of the Cathedral.
Assurances are sought that the fabric and fittings of the building, including the TC Lewis Pipe Organ, won’t be damaged as a result of construction vibration.

MATC is concerned about the long term effects of exposure to the combination of dust, vibration and noise on the fabric of the building, staff, congregations and visitors.

St Paul’s has concerns regarding noise, dust and vibration caused by construction activities within the CBD South station precinct.

In Precinct 6: CBD South Station, noise thresholds are expected to be exceeded up to three times during construction for up to five weeks at a time. It is noted that specific noise guidelines have not been identified for St Paul’s Cathedral as have been identified for the Parkville Health precinct. Noise above tram levels will be disruptive to the liturgical life of the Cathedral including being intrusive to the music. The music programme of the Cathedral is integral to worship with many worshipers specifically gravitating to the choral and organ recitals of the Cathedral. In addition, many pilgrims seek solace in the Cathedral as a place of contemplation and prayer. Any such noise disruption will be exacerbated if Saturdays and Sundays are assumed to be opportunities for increases in construction activity.

The Cathedral contains an historic pipe organ valued in excess of $4 million which from past experience is susceptible to vibration and dust impacting on the quality of sound and preservation of the instrument. Presently, a monthly regime of tuning and cleaning of the organ takes place in order to maintain its optimum function. Additional ground movement, vibration and dust from construction and excavation would place increased stress on the organ resulting in the need for additional cleaning and preventative maintenance works. It is probable that increased maintenance will be required for the duration of the construction of Melbourne Metro.

St Paul’s has an electronic sign set back from the corner of Swanston and Finders. It is also susceptible to dust. Currently the filter of the sign is changed on an annual basis, and it is anticipated that the filter will need to be changed more regularly with additional maintenance requirements for the duration of the construction of Melbourne Metro. Contributions to the increased cost of maintenance of both the organ and signage are requested.

Measures to minimise the level of airborne dust and soil particles as a result of construction activity should be taken by construction contractors. Measures such as the covering of all trucks leaving the construction site with excavated spoil with retractable tarps should be implemented during construction. Practices that minimise the negative impacts of construction should be rigorously enforced by the MMRA and construction contractors.

As noted, St Paul’s is a stone building dating from 1892, and susceptible to vibration. It is not clear that specific steps have been taken to understand the particular issues related to the construction and sub-structure of St Paul’s and to ensure that the Cathedral will not suffer any damage during construction, especially given that there are times when vibration is expected to exceed guidelines. Additionally, given the nature of excavated material and toxicity of fine dust particles, there should be provision for cleaning the stonework and stained glass of St Paul’s and regular inspections to detect any detrimental impacts due to toxic dust both internally and externally.
A consideration of noise, vibration and dust impacts of construction on St Paul’s Cathedral and a RFI list prepared by Robert Bird Group for St Paul’s Cathedral is attached at Appendix A.

Specific outcomes sought:

21. Compensation for additional maintenance, repairs and cleaning of the Cathedral as a result of vibration and additional dust from construction activities.

22. Implementation of sophisticated programme of air quality monitoring to:
   - Determine baseline conditions; and
   - Evaluate construction impacts.

23. Investigate potential short/medium term design changes such as a new airlock at Cathedral entrance.

24. Ensure measures are taken to reduce the amount of dust generated, e.g.:
   - Acoustic shed;
   - Hard covers on trucks.

4.7 CONSTRUCTION HOARDINGS AND ACOUSTIC SHEDS

As the Cathedral precinct is likely to be fronted on three sides with hoardings for considerable periods, the location, type and finish of the hoardings is of direct interest.

MATC seeks involvement with MMRP in a process for resolving the location, type and finish of construction hoardings and acoustic sheds.

MATC would value the opportunity to contribute suggestions as to the use of public art, imagery and messaging on hoardings in and around the Cathedral precinct.

We note that an Urban Design Strategy has been developed to manage landscape and visual impacts during construction and to set a high standard and quality of design for the entire project. While aesthetic hoardings and other measures would mitigate construction impacts at ground level, medium to high temporary visual impacts would occur at a number of locations, including St Paul’s Cathedral. It is likely that through the duration of the construction process there will be a variety of construction hoardings surrounding the Cathedral both immediately surrounding and within a close vicinity of the Cathedral. It is assumed that construction hoardings will be positioned at City Square aligned to the north side of Flinders Lane; Federation Square aligned to the South Side of Flinders Street; and between the Nicholas Building and the Young and Jackson building aligned to the west side of Swanston Street. While construction hoardings are an essential component of construction management to ensure the safety of the public, there is no reason that they can’t be designed in a sensitive way to respect their surroundings.

It is also anticipated that acoustic sheds over construction sites at City Square, Federation Square and between the Nicholas and Young and Jackson buildings will be in place for the duration of tunnel construction. There is limited information available on the likely siting, scale and design of acoustic sheds. However it is assumed that these structures may be some of the most prominent of construction structures throughout the tunnelling stage of the project. In recognition of their visual prominence and potential to diminish views of the Cathedral during construction,
particular consideration to the design and configuration of acoustic sheds should be given. The Cathedral has an active interest in contributing to the development of design treatments for these structures.

With construction of the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel anticipated to take place for the duration of time between 2017 and 2028, it must be understood that construction hoardings and acoustic sheds will be a semi-permanent feature of the city for a significant period of time. These structures should contribute to, not detract from, the environments within which they are located in terms of their visual impact and general amenity.

Reflecting what will likely be the long-term presence of hoardings and sheds, the configuration and design of these structures must go beyond just being tidy, presentable or uniform. In addition, the graphic and illustrative elements on hoardings and sheds should go beyond just marketing or advertising material and contribute to a sense of place for the duration of their presence.

The Cathedral would like input into the siting, appearance and finish of hoardings and acoustic sheds surrounding the Cathedral and would particularly like a role in contributing to the illustrative or interpretive elements contained on hoardings and acoustic sheds.

4.8 REDESIGN OF CITY SQUARE

The proposed redesign of City Square, which provides the northern setting for the Cathedral and is an adjoining land use, is of vital interest to St Paul’s.

MATC has a vital interest in the design and use of a redeveloped City Square, and seeks close-in involvement in the resolution of the plans.

Views to the Cathedral from City Square should be maintained.

The north south axial view towards the Cathedral as accentuated by the existing water feature should be maintained.

An integral component of the current design of the City Square is based around the axis of the water feature, which aligns with the centre aisle of the Cathedral. This provides a dignified and appropriate setting for a major civic building of symmetrical plan, with its dominating axis running parallel to Swanston Street. This classical style of design is well suited to the Cathedral, and to the formal geometry of the Hoddle Grid.

The development of the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel will require the demolition, redesign and reconstruction of City Square. City Square has evolved over time through a number of iterations in its configuration, design and function. The current design and configuration of City Square has broadly been successful and has become a well utilised and appreciated space in the Melbourne CBD. It is of particular importance for City Square to provide an attractive landscape setting for the Cathedral.
The northern face of St Paul’s Cathedral has an interface with City Square across Flinders Lane with the Cathedral’s altar and western transept aligning with the boundary of City Square. Additionally, the grounds of the Cathedral which comprise of a grassed area and seating also align with City Square.

City Square currently incorporates design elements such as trees, grass, seating and a water feature all of which currently contribute to a pleasant landscape setting for the Cathedral and other surrounding buildings. It is appreciated that a redesigned City Square will be required to incorporate additional Metro-related features such as station entrance, vents, shafts and emergency exits. It is however understood that these features will not require a large area of space.
The Cathedral supports the location of the northern City Square station entrance on the corner of Collins and Swanston Streets so long as the north-south axial views are preserved. However the proposed location of a second entrance at the south-eastern corner of City Square on Flinders Lane is not supported. A south-eastern entrance would interrupt the established viewing axis through City Square to the Cathedral’s altar and western transept. It is the view of the Cathedral that a second entrance should be provided at the south-western corner of City Square within the current area used for a café and associated vents.

Figure 10 View of the Cathedral’s northern front from City Square

There is in a sense a tension between the Gothic architecture of the Cathedral and its classical setting in a rectilinear grid of streets. Gothic is traditionally associated with the Romantic Movement, and its pinnacles and spires are the antithesis of cool, classical design. The plan form of traditional church architecture is based around the nave and the transept, with the crossing offset towards the eastern end of the church – most historic churches being orientated with the apse towards the east. The plan is
far from symmetrical either side of the transept, but close to symmetric along the axis of the nave.

St Paul’s was designed to parallel the Hoddle Grid, not to ‘face east’. Its siting has therefore more in common with the classical ideal, and the longitudinal symmetry of its plan is strongly expressed in the third dimension. Therefore it is appropriate to provide a setting in City Square (which is within the Hoddle Grid) that expresses the formality of this arrangement. [London’s Palace of Westminster – the Houses of Parliament – also embodies a tension, in this case between classical plan and Gothic aesthetic.]

The future use of the southern end of City Square, and any built form to be incorporated there, is of particular interest to the Cathedral on two grounds. First, the activity needs to be compatible with the spiritual activity within the body of the Cathedral, in terms of noise generation and public image. Second, the built form needs to enhance the Cathedral’s setting – or at least not detract from it. This perspective on the Cathedral is at least as important as views towards the south face or principal frontage entry. Therefore any proposal to provide a structure in this area of the Square should ensure the views to the Cathedral are uninterrupted. While the café building currently obscures part of this view at present, this should not be repeated in a permanent station entry structure.

It is noted that redesign of the City Square in future may enable other improvements to the visibility of St Paul’s from the south, including relocation of the water wall structure on Collins Street.

Specific outcome sought:

25. Ensure the redesign of City Square maintains the north south axial view towards the Cathedral.

4.9 CATHEDRAL CLOSE & SWANSTON STREET FRONTAGE

There is an opportunity to improve the ways in which the Cathedral precinct interfaces with the city.

City of Melbourne is in discussion with MATC about possible conversion of part of the Cathedral Close parking area to public open space, and seeks MMRP involvement.

Construction of MMRP also provides an opportunity to review the design of the Cathedral’s interface with Swanston Street and Flinders Street, and to review the total setting for the Cathedral.

The City of Melbourne is currently in discussions with the Cathedral over potentially utilising land currently used as a car park abutting Charter House Lane to the east of the Cathedral as public open space. The Cathedral supports in principle the utilisation of this space as a park subject to appropriate remuneration for its use.

The temporary closure of City Square will place greater demand onto surrounding areas of open space including Federation Square, Treasury Gardens and Birrarung Marr. There is potential for the open space surrounding the Cathedral to be utilised as public open space during and after construction, potentially ameliorating some of the impacts of loss of open space.

The design and development of any open space surrounding the Cathedral should be coordinated and consider the entire setting of the Cathedral including the car park,
grassed area on Swanston Street, the Flinders Street frontage and Cathedral Close. The relationships between the setting of the Cathedral and City Square should also be considered to maximise the amount of meaningful open space available to the public in the CBD and to enhance the overall setting of the Cathedral.

Formalised public access to Cathedral Close and Chapter House Lane which runs between Flinders Lane and Flinders Street may generate additional pedestrian movements from Collins Street through the undercroft of the Westin Hotel through to Flinders Street via Chapter House Lane. An investigation of an additional pedestrian crossing point aligned with Chapter House Lane across Flinders Street to Federation Square, potentially including a ‘Barnes Dance’ style of pedestrian crossing at Swanston Street, should be undertaken.

Construction of MMRP also provides an opportunity to review the design of the Cathedral’s interface with Swanston Street. The current landscaped setback with seating bays has remained essentially unchanged for many decades.

4.10 THE VIEW OF THE CATHEDRAL’S SOUTH FRONT

Changes to the design of Federation Square need to acknowledge that the Cathedral’s south front is an important part of Melbourne’s identity.

MATC is vitally interested in the design outcomes on Federation Square, arising from MMRP structures and the redesign of the western ‘shard’, and wishes to be involved in key design and siting decisions.

The view from St Paul’s Court within Federation Square should not alter from the current view when viewed on the north-south axis.

The view from Princes Bridge remains equally important

A station entrance, and possibly ventilation and emergency access structures, is to be located opposite St Paul’s in Federation Square. Demolition of the western ‘shard’, currently occupied by the visitor information centre, is proposed. Page 73 of the EES Urban Design Strategy includes this Design Guideline:

Consider rebuilding the western shard in keeping with the original design intent, increasing its height in order to reinstate its tall vertical proportions.

The current framing of the south front of the Cathedral, when seen from St Paul’s Court in Federation Square, is well handled. MATC believes that a replication of this framing effect is essential in the new design, and that any new MMRP-related structures should avoid impinging on this view.

The Cathedral would object to any proposal for above ground construction and structures between the two existing shards that would obstruct the view to the Cathedral from St Paul’s Court which is the principal unobstructed viewing point towards the main face of the Cathedral and its spires. Less intensive and obtrusive urban design treatments between the shards at ground level which do not impact on views of the Cathedral would be supported. In response to the absence of sufficiently detailed information in the ESS on the Federation Square station entrance the Cathedral seeks the opportunity to contribute to the ultimate design of the Federation Square station entrance. The redesign/reconfiguration of the western shard presents particular design challenges. The positioning and size of the original design of this shard, intruding into some middle-distance views of the Cathedral’s southern face was at the time of original proposal, and continues to be, unacceptable.
The view of the Cathedral front from the south is of a different quality to the view from the north, across City Square. Both City Square and St Paul’s are within the Hoddle Grid, a form of cityscape in which classical formality is an appropriate design response. City Square has been laid out around the north-south axis of the cathedral nave, in a way that relates the square to the Cathedral, and pays respect to its architecture.

Federation Square is, by contrast, outside the Hoddle Grid. The design of Federation Square is anything but formal and classical – it is not the place to attempt a design solution using the syntax of City Square. The difficult question is: How much of the south front of the Cathedral should be obscured by the western shard, and what form should it take?

This is not the place to answer a question that will require a considerable design effort, and that warrants a degree of public exposure and debate. It is likely to raise a similar level of interest as occurred when Federation Square was first designed. MATC is vitally interested in the design outcomes on Federation Square, and shares a belief that the community at large should be involved in debating the best design treatment.
Specific outcome sought:

26. The view from St Paul’s Court within Federation Square should not alter from the current view when viewed on the north-south axis.

4.11 PEDESTRIAN ROUTES, POST-CONSTRUCTION

The works associated with the MMRP provide an opportunity to consider permanent improvements to pedestrian circulation through and around the Cathedral Precinct.

MATC offers to work with MMRP to review pedestrian circulation through and around the Cathedral Precinct.

Opportunities may exist to improve pedestrian circulation:

- To the east of the Cathedral, linking the south east corner of City Square to Flinders Street.
- At the crossing of Flinders Street, possibly by extending (not moving) the Flinders Street/Swanston Street pedestrian crossing east along Flinders Street, opposite the south front of the Cathedral; urban design and paving improvements associated with this could provide an enhanced visual setting for the Cathedral.

The operation of the CBD South Station is expected to generate thousands of more pedestrian movements on a daily basis in the station precinct area. This, combined with the anticipated increase in public transport patronage and other pedestrian movements within the CBD presents a major challenge for the safe and orderly movement of pedestrian flows through the CBD. Additionally, efficient pedestrian access to the Cathedral may be jeopardised by inefficient or unsafe pedestrian networks surrounding the CBD South Station.

Some of this additional pedestrian movement will be facilitated by underground walkways, connecting the new CBD South Station to Federation Square and Flinders Street. However, it is likely in any circumstance surface level pedestrian flows across Swanston Street, Flinders Street and Collins Street will increase beyond the current high flows.

A new pedestrian link for the long term from Federation Square to Collin Street via Chapter House Lane and the undercroft of the Westin Hotel, including a new pedestrian crossing point across Flinders Street, should be considered to enhance CBD permeability and ease the pressure on footpaths on Swanston and Elizabeth Streets. The Swanston Street/Flinders Street pedestrian crossing already experiences heavy pedestrian loads across the day (particularly at peak times) with pedestrians banking up on footpaths waiting for signals and often overflowing onto the roadway. The crossing has been identified as an area of severe pedestrian overcrowding in the City of Melbourne’s Walking Plan. There is also a prevalence of pedestrians crossing against the signal in order to get a ‘head start’ on the traffic cycle.

The combination of existing and anticipated future volumes of pedestrian movement as a result of the CBD South Station must be addressed to ensure the safe and efficient movement of people through the city. The development of a station access plan which considers issues such as signal timing, crossing configuration, urban design treatments, new crossing points and footpath width should be developed to resolve issues relating to future pedestrian flows.
4.12 SWANSTON STREET WEST SIDE

The west side of Swanston Street, opposite the Cathedral, includes a cluster of important heritage buildings and a key MMRP development site.

An essential design parameter for the redevelopment of the properties on the west side of Swanston Street should be the view to and from and against St Paul’s.

The forty metre height limit on the west side of Swanston Street should not be varied under discretion for commercial advantage.

The opportunity should be grasped to further upgrade the quality of ground floor uses opposite the Cathedral, and to improve the public realm of this block of Swanston Street.

The CBD South Station Precinct contains a number of significant heritage buildings including: St Paul’s Cathedral, Finders Street Station, the Melbourne Town Hall, the Young and Jackson Hotel and the Nicholas Building. These buildings make a strong positive contribution to the character and sense of place within the station precinct and are representative of some of the most significant heritage buildings in Melbourne.

The design of any buildings on the western side of Swanston Street between the Nicholas building and Young and Jacksons should consider the silhouette of St Paul’s and avoid overshadowing the grassed area to the west of the Cathedral. We note the outcome at 171 Collins Street, whilst not entirely acceptable, is a superior outcome to that achieved on the Westin Hotel. The concept of a curtain wall veil on the building is something that could be supported. The 40m height limit should not be varied under discretion for commercial advantage. The highest level decision-making guideline should be the view to and from and against St Paul’s.

Presently the streetscape treatments surrounding these buildings do not convey the significance of individual heritage buildings or read as one heritage precinct.

It is noted that the Port Phillip Arcade and several adjoining retail premises on Swanston Street will be demolished during construction of the tunnel. Any development to replace these buildings should reflect and respect the heritage values of the precinct.

There is an opportunity to improve the overall setting of these buildings through urban design and appropriate landscape treatments. Additionally there is scope to lift the quality of the public realm connecting these buildings including the provision of interpretive signage.

Specific outcome sought:

27. Avoid the removal of mature plane trees from Swanston Street during construction.
STATION STRUCTURES INCLUDING ENTRANCES

The design of station structures on Collins Street, Flinders Street and Swanston Street needs clarification.

The visual impact of CBD South Station structures should be minimised and be designed to maintain the prominence of heritage buildings.

The Melbourne Metro Urban Design Strategy should provide detailed guidelines on how surface structures will be assessed to meet standards of high quality design and finish.

The view of St Paul’s Cathedral from St Paul’s Court should not alter from the current view when viewed on the north-south axis.

Two new station entrances for the CBD South Station will be constructed within the vicinity of the Cathedral on the corner of Collins Street and Swanston Street and another on Flinders Street at Federation Square (in the vicinity of the Melbourne Visitors Information Centre). These two locations are prominent in both the context of their position in the city and in the context of their relationship with St Paul’s Cathedral. The location, orientation, configuration, height, bulk and design of these station entrances present both a risk and opportunity to contribute positively to the fabric of the city.

The existing structure at Federation Square will likely need to be demolished and rebuilt to incorporate station facilities. In relation to the re-design or re-configuration of the Federation Square Shards it is submitted that the view from St Paul’s Court within Federation Square should not alter from the current view when viewed on the north-south axis (see below).

Clarification is required in the description and language used within EES documents to describe the location and operation of a station entrance to the CBD South Station at Federation Square. While the Map Book and Urban Design Strategy (Appendix M) indicate that a station structures will be contained within the footprints of the existing ‘east’ and ‘west’ shards, the Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment (Appendix L) and Transport Impact Assessment – Part 1 (Appendix D) indicate that there will be a station entrance between the ‘east’ and ‘west’ Shards.

It is unclear if it is the intention of the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority to construct a station entrance structure such as a canopy between the shards; or if it is intended to use the space between the shards in a less intensive way with ground level urban design treatments leading passengers towards more intensive structures contained within shards. The absence of a concept design for the Federation Square station entrance and station structures adds to uncertainty and confusion around the siting, appearance and configuration of a Federation Square station entrance.

It is important that the design of station structures does not further obscure views or detract or compete with the scale or prominence of the Cathedral particularly from key viewpoints. The design of station entrances must meet urban design objectives for the Capital City, but also manage immediate relationships with Federation Square, Flinders Street Station, St Paul’s Cathedral and the Melbourne Town Hall. There is a tension between providing prominent station entrances to maximise their visibility and providing subtle station entrances in respect of their surroundings.
While the majority of station structures, such as platforms, concourses and information desks will be located underground there is a requirement that passenger entry/exit portals are provided at grade for access into the CBD South Station.

The Urban Design Strategy developed for the project would require that all surface structures are of a high quality design and finish, integrate with their location and settings, and have appropriate footprints.” This statement is too general and does not outline what high quality design and finish is or how it is to be assessed. More detailed design guidelines are required. The way the visual impacts of the project will
be managed through compliance with the Melbourne Metro Urban Design Strategy also needs to be given greater weight in the case of St Paul’s Cathedral.

### 4.14 VENTS, SHAFTS AND EMERGENCY EXITS

*The design, configuration and location of vents, shafts and emergency exits need clarification.*

Vents, shafts, emergency exits and other auxiliary features of the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel should be sited sensitively to ensure they don’t detract from the appearance of the Cathedral.

MATC would value the opportunity to provide input into the location and configuration of vents, shafts and emergency exits associated with the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel.

Ventilation units, ventilation shafts, emergency exits and other elements are important components of underground rail tunnels. Despite their importance their presence at surface level can generally detract from the amenity and appearance of their surrounds.

The proposed locations of these elements of the CBD South Station precinct are not clearly marked in the comprehensive map book. This makes it difficult to ascertain the potential impact of these features on the surrounds of the Cathedral. It is particularly important to understand where these features will be located and, how will they operate and the likely disruption they may generate when the tunnel is in its operational phase.

It is noted that an existing ventilation shaft associated with the underground car park beneath City Square is located within the southern corner of square. A café structure which has been devised to sleeve the ventilation shaft encloses the southern end of City Square and acts as a barrier to the Cathedral and the open space around it. The relationship between City Square and the Cathedral (particularly the open space setting around the Cathedral) could be enhanced with a less solid structure between the two.

The Cathedral is particularly of the view that vents, emergency exits and other features should not be ‘dumped’ on Flinders Lane as it is considered to be the rear of the Cathedral.

### 4.15 ASSURANCE OF DESIGN QUALITY

*Design quality needs to be assured by means of appropriate process.*

Further detail is sought as to how visual impacts would be managed through compliance with the Melbourne Metro Urban Design Strategy, and what if any interaction with this process would be afforded to St Paul’s.

The EES Executive Summary states:

*As is typical for an EES, the Concept Design is not the final design for Melbourne Metro. Further refinements could be made by the companies contracted to develop and deliver the project as detailed design is developed and finalised. These design refinements are anticipated to occur primarily within the proposed project boundary. Consequently, the potential effects of these refinements have been contemplated by the EES and would be managed through complying with the Environmental Performance Requirements. (EES Exec Summary p E-9)*
How does the process work to allow for St Paul’s to review alternate designs?

*The Urban Design Strategy developed for the project would require that all surface structures are of a high quality design and finish, integrate with their location and settings, and have appropriate footprints.*

This statement is too broad and does not outline what criteria will be used to assess the ‘high quality design and finish’ is (criteria).

Further detail is requested as to how it is intended visual impacts will be managed through compliance with the Melbourne Metro Urban Design Strategy and what, if any, interaction with this process would be afforded to St Paul’s.

### 4.16 AMENDMENT GC45 (DDO)

*The proposed Planning Scheme Amendment should encompass the minimum necessary land area and timeframe.*

Reduce the area covered by Amendment GC45 to the land explicitly subject to air rights purchase by the MMRP, and/or include in Amendment GC45 a sunset clause removing the overlay that includes St Paul’s at the conclusion of the construction works.

A draft Planning Scheme Amendment, Amendment GC45, has been prepared by the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority with the aim of facilitating the timely and orderly construction of the tunnel, as well as maintaining the operation and protecting the infrastructure of the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel once constructed.

Amendment GC45 proposes a new schedule to the Design and Development Overlay (DDO) to protect Melbourne Metro from inappropriate development and to facilitate construction activities. The DDO would require a development plan to be prepared to the satisfaction of the Minister of Planning, addressing key issues relating to the design and operation of development.

The proposed DDO Control applies to the South-West Corner of the Cathedral site above where an underground pedestrian passage is proposed to be built connecting the CBD South Station to Federation Square. Additionally the proposed DDO control also applies to the land between the Cathedral and Chapter House Lane which is presently used as a car park.

It is unclear as to why the grounds of the Cathedral have been identified as comprising part of the DDO; the subject land has not been identified as the site for any buildings or works associated with the Melbourne Metro Rail Tunnel. Nor is it likely that development on the subject land would present any structural issues or compromise the operations of the tunnel once built. The car park land should be excluded from the DDO. Alternatively, the DDO control on the car park land should expire upon the successful completion of the Melbourne Metro project.

Specific outcomes sought:

28. Reduce the area covered by Amendment GC45 to the land explicitly subject to air rights purchase by the MMRP.

29. Include in Amendment GC45 a sunset clause removing the overlay that includes St Paul’s at the conclusion of the construction works.
4.17 SUSTAINABILITY

The MMRP project provides an opportunity to demonstrate best sustainable practice in construction and design.

The MMRP project should demonstrate best sustainable practice in construction and design.

Projects which seek to improve sustainable living and the protection of the earth through the adoption of environmentally sustainable practices are supported by the Mission Commitments of the Cathedral. The Melbourne Metro Rail Project will enhance the sustainability of Melbourne by improving public transport access to the CBD and facilitating additional trips via public transport across Metropolitan Melbourne. While the project itself will have a number of benefits for the sustainability of Melbourne there are a variety of opportunities to further enhance the environmental yield of the project in both construction and operation.

Potential actions to improve and enhance the sustainability outcomes of the Melbourne Metro Rail Project include:

- Using the hot air from the tunnels for a secondary purpose.
- Incorporating renewable energy such as solar panels on station structures
- Minimising use of potable water during the construction process
- Harvesting and reuse of stormwater
- Recycling of demolition materials
- Providing bicycle parking at stations

The Cathedral has undertaken a number of improvements within its building to enhance sustainability such as re-lamping to LED and developing a relationship with Environment Victoria. There are further opportunities within the St Paul’s building and environs including rainwater harvesting and reuse that could be explored as part of the Metro Rail project. The Cathedral is willing to work with the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority, construction teams and rail operators to explore mutually beneficial opportunities to improve the water and energy efficiency of the Melbourne Metro Rail Project in both construction and operation.
APPENDIX A

St Paul’s Cathedral Structural Review and Request for Information List, prepared by Robert Bird Group
Reference: CB:DF LTR/S 20004T

29 June 2016

The Melbourne Anglican Foundation
C/- Deutscher Associates
PO Box 1104
FITZROY NORTH VIC 3068

Attention: Rob Deutscher

Dear Sir

RE: ST PAULS CATHEDRAL STRUCTURAL REVIEW OF MMRP EES & PREPARATION OF RFI LIST PRECINCT 6: CBD SOUTH STATION

Further to your invitation dated 31st May and our proposal dated 7th June 2016, Robert Bird Group are pleased to present draft findings of our review of the Melbourne Metro Rail Project (MMRP) Environmental Effects Statement (EES).

A representative of Robert Bird Group undertook a site inspection of the Cathedral and grounds together with Deutscher Associates on the 8th June 2016. Photos of the existing condition are appended to this report for future record.

The purpose of this report is to summarise our findings associated with our comprehensive review of the MMRP EES as it relates to structure and foundations of the existing Cathedral building and prepare a formal Request For Information (RFI) list for the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority (MMRA) via Deutscher Associates.

Summary of Findings and Site Inspection

Based on our site inspection and comprehensive review of the EES to date, we confirm the following RFI list for your consideration and submission to the MMRA.

As part of our review process, Robert Bird Group have reviewed all of the EES and identified the most relevant section of the EES to be chapter 19 – Ground Movement and Land Stability together with chapter 13 and relevant supporting reports and technical appendices.

Chapter 19 of the report highlights that “Ground Movement is an expected outcome of any tunneling project” and that the evaluation objective is to avoid or minimise adverse effects on land stability that might arise directly or indirectly from project works. The EES also indicates that this objective would be achieved practically through implementation of engineering solutions that would minimise ground movements, however we note further work is required at this time.

Although we are satisfied with the overall objective of the draft EES report we require a much greater definition of protection works with respect to this highly valued and vibration sensitive heritage listed Cathedral building given the draft EES appears to be generic in nature with respect to the Cathedral.

Based on Table 19-13 we understand that St Pauls Cathedral falls within Precinct 6: CBD South Station and the advice in this table indicates the Heritage building would be subject to Negligible to Minor impacts with respect to ground movements.
Based on our review of the Golder Associates Geological Setting EES Summary Report, we understand the St Pauls Cathedral site is founded over a siltstone and sandstone base and the CBD South Station (in Precinct 6) will be constructed using and underground mined cavern excavation to fresh siltstone and sandstone with 34m deep full soldier pile retention or similar access shafts. The South Station access shafts will be located in the City Square and at Flinders Street Station.

Unfortunately the Cathedral is very sensitive to vibration based on past experience, therefore please find attached RFI list specifically related to the St Paul’s Cathedral Building and Grounds:

**Request for Information List**

1. Please confirm the effects of groundwater drawdown to the existing geological conditions at the St Paul’s Cathedral site and particularly below the existing foundations of the existing heritage building?
2. Please confirm extent of primary consolidation settlement due to groundwater drawdown below the Cathedral building and site?
3. Will traffic vibration be exacerbated as a result of the tunneling work?
4. We request that the MMRA give due consideration to the cathedral organ which is extremely sensitive to ground vibration, to ensure it is not affected by the works and ongoing operation. Similar applies to other valuable fixtures and fittings within this heritage listed building.
5. We wish to inform the MMRA that the valuable Cathedral organ is extremely sensitive to ground vibration based on past experience. Re-tuning of the organ is an expensive and time consuming process. Will MMRA agree to cover these costs?
6. Please confirm there will be no detrimental effects to the heritage building as a result of these proposed works both during construction and post rail occupation? Will MMRA agree to cover these repair costs?
7. Please confirm what measures have been implemented to measure, monitor and control ground vibration and regenerated noise from the works during construction and operation of the MMR?
8. Please confirm what limits will be placed on audibility of the Melbourne Metro noise with respect to acoustics and vibration?
9. If any damage is caused to our property, fittings and fixtures, please confirm what procedure would be implemented in order for it to be adequately rectified and restored? Will MMRA agree to cover these costs?
10. Please provide a site specific EES report for the cathedral site confirming any potential adverse impacts to the heritage building structure and the site in general as a result of the works and future operations.
11. From our review of the Golder Associates Geological Setting EES Summary Report we appreciate that some Plaxis analysis was undertaken however the building form was not included in the model therefore we believe this work should be undertaken. Will MMRA agree to undertake this site specific analysis?
12. Please supply us with a copy of the proposed ground movement plan for construction and operation phases of the Melbourne Metro.
13. Please confirm what timeframe will be provided to assess the suitability and acceptance of the proposed implementation measure to control ground vibration and noise associated with proposed works and operation?
14. Will the essential services supply from below ground to the Cathedral site be impacted by the works and final operations?
15. Will new connections to services be required as a result of the works?
16. We confirm the heritage listed cathedral structure is not a flexible building that would be very sensitive to ground movement and vibration and any change to existing founding condition, therefore please confirm that due technical consideration will be given to this building, in order to specifically address all of our concerns noted above? Our expectation would be a level 3 assessment for this site of heritage significance. Will MMRA agree to undertake this site specific analysis?
17. We request a full soil and structural interaction model be undertaken for the Cathedral taking into account proposed works and expected ground movements. To ensure no parts of the existing building are overstressed as a result of the proposed works and metro operation. Will MMRA agree to undertake this site specific analysis?
18. How would structural isolation be implemented if proposed?
19. Will the proposed works result in any differential settlement effects on our site?
20. Will MMRA conduct a fully detailed dilapidation survey of the existing heritage building structure prior to commencing any works and supply a copy for our record and review?
21. Please confirm construction method of the pedestrian access tunnel from CBD South Station to Federation Square which cross our property boundary in the south west corner.

We trust the above request for information list, as it relates to the St Paul’s Cathedral is clear, fair and reasonable, and will be addressed in detail by the MMRA, however please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned for any further clarification, if required.

Yours faithfully

ROBERT BIRD GROUP PTY LTD

JOHN BAMBINO
Victoria General Manager